

## **SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

Minutes of a meeting of the Council held on  
Thursday, 18 October 2007 at 2.00 p.m.

PRESENT: Councillor JH Stewart – Chairman  
Councillor RE Barrett – Vice-Chairman

Councillors: Dr DR Bard, JD Batchelor, Mrs PM Bear, AN Berent, D Bird, EW Bullman, FWM Burkitt, BR Burling, TD Bygott, NN Cathcart, Mrs PS Corney, NS Davies, Miss JA Dipple, SM Edwards, Mrs SM Ellington, Mrs VG Ford, R Hall, Dr SA Harangozo, Mrs SA Hatton, Mrs EM Heazell, JA Hockney, MP Howell, Mrs CA Hunt, PT Johnson, SGM Kindersley, Mrs JE Lockwood, RMA Manning, RB Martlew, MJ Mason, RM Matthews, DC McCraith, DH Morgan, Mrs LA Morgan, CR Nightingale, AG Orgee, A Riley, Mrs DP Roberts, NJ Scarr, Mrs HM Smith, Mrs DSK Spink MBE, RT Summerfield, Mrs VM Trueman, RJ Turner, Dr SEK van de Ven, Mrs BE Waters, JF Williams, TJ Wotherspoon and NIC Wright

Officers:	Catriona Dunnett	Principal Solicitor
	Steve Hampson	Executive Director
	Greg Harlock	Chief Executive
	Richard May	Democratic Services Manager

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor JP Chatfield, NCF Bolitho, Mrs A Elsby, Mrs JM Guest, Mrs SJO Doggett, Mrs CAED Murfitt and JA Quinlan.

### **36. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor SGM Kindersley declared a personal non-prejudicial interest in Agenda item 9 (Request for support from the Royal Anglian Regiment) as a member of the Gamlingay branch of the Royal British Legion. Notwithstanding this interest he remained in the meeting and took part in the discussions and voting.

Councillor Mrs DP Roberts declared a personal non-prejudicial interest in Agenda item 9 (Request for support from the Royal Anglian Regiment) on the grounds that her father received a war pension. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting and took part in the discussions and voting.

Councillor Mrs EM Heazell declared a personal non-prejudicial interest in Agenda item 9 (Request for support from the Royal Anglian Regiment) on the grounds that her sister's school fees had been paid by the Army Benevolent Fund. Notwithstanding this interest she remained in the meeting and took part in the discussions and voting.

Members of the Northstowe Joint Development Control Committee (Councillors JD Batchelor, Mrs PS Corney, SM Edwards, SGM Kindersley, A Riley and TJ Wotherspoon) advised that they would leave the room during consideration Agenda item 7(a) (Northstowe: Setting an expectation for carbon reduction and the generation of renewable energy) to enable them to participate fully in the discussion of such matters as part of the determination of planning applications by the joint committee.

Councillor Mrs DP Roberts advised that she would leave the room during discussion of Agenda item 13(b) (Notice of Motion standing in the names of A Riley and NJ Scarr) as

she did not feel able to consider the matter dispassionately.

### 37. MINUTES

Council **RESOLVED** that the Minutes of the meetings held on 17 (Extraordinary Meeting) and 19 July and 27 September (Extraordinary Meeting) 2007 be approved as correct records and signed by the Chairman, subject to the following amendments:

#### 17 July 2007

- Note apologies for absence received from Councillors TD Bygott and RM Matthews.
- **Minute 2 (Declarations of interest)** Councillor Dr DR Bard advised that his membership was of the Superannuation Scheme for all universities, not specifically that of Cambridge University. This applied also to the interests declared by Councillors EW Bullman, Mrs CAED Murfitt and A Riley.

#### 19 July 2007

- The addition of Councillors RM Matthews, MJ Mason, DC McCraith, RMA Manning and RB Martlew to the list to Members present.
- **Minute 22 (Declarations of Interest)** Councillors RT Summerfield and Mrs HM Smith's personal non-prejudicial interests had been declared as members of the Milton Parish Council as well as the Save Milton Country Park campaign.
- **Minute 22 (Declarations of Interest)** Councillor RE Barrett had not declared an interest in the item concerning Milton Country Park.

In respect of Minute 29 (Future of Milton Country Park), Councillor A Riley advised that, during the discussion on 19 July, the Leader had indicated the Chief Executive Officer of Cambridge Sports Lakes Trust among the public and had mentioned that he had considerable experience of running a Country Park. In the light of him having announced his resignation very shortly after the 19 July Councillor Riley asked whether it was known on 19 July that he was about to resign. The Chief Executive advised that he and the Leader had known about the impending resignation. Councillor VG Ford, Resources Portfolio Holder, advised that a meeting with the new Chief Executive was scheduled to take place during the week beginning 22 October.

### 38. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Chairman announced with regret the recent death of Councillor Stan Symonds, a former Chairman of the Council.

Members were advised that places remained on forthcoming Member Development Programme Modules on Scrutiny and Overview and Chairing Skills. Any Member wishing to attend should contact the Democratic Services Manager as soon as possible.

### 39. QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS AND THE PUBLIC

#### 39 (a) From Councillor JD Batchelor to Councillor MP Howell, Community Services Portfolio Holder

Councillor JD Batchelor asked the Community Services Portfolio Holder the following question:

1. When does the Portfolio Holder intend holding an official portfolio meeting?
2. How was the decision to hold a review of the grants system taken, and by whom?
3. How many meetings has the Portfolio Holder failed to attend in the last six months?

Councillor MP Howell, Community Services Portfolio Holder, answered as follows:

1. A Portfolio Holder meeting was scheduled to take place on 1 November 2007 at 9.30am.
2. This issue was debated thoroughly at the Scrutiny and Overview Committee meeting on 11 October 2007. Councillor Howell advised that the grants review had been his decision.
3. Councillor Howell advised that he had attended four Cabinet meetings out of six, one of which he had had to leave almost immediately due to family illness, two meetings of Council out of two and had attended all meetings of the Local Strategic Partnership and Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnership. He had not attended either of the two Extraordinary Council Meetings.

Councillor JD Batchelor put forward the view that Councillor Howell's overall attendance record of around 65% illustrated the difficulties experienced by Members in full-time employment carrying out their duties as members of the Cabinet without a great deal of flexibility by the employer concerned. Councillor Batchelor went on to draw Council's attention to a recommendation later in the Agenda that Portfolio Holder meetings be made public; whilst this was a positive step, it would be of no benefit if regular meetings were not held. Further concern was expressed at the holding by the Cabinet of weekly Leader's meetings in private, at which important matters were deliberated without proper accountability.

Councillor Howell advised that the need to hold a Portfolio Holder meeting had not arisen until now, and that the Leader's meeting was an opportunity for the Cabinet to undertake forward planning, where necessary with the Chief Executive present. He considered himself fully accountable for the recent grants review.

Councillor RMA Manning, Leader of the Council, advised that he had full confidence in Councillor Howell regardless of the pressures of his career. He added that the Leader's meeting also provided a vital means of communication between Portfolio Holders.

#### **40. PETITIONS**

Councillor Mrs EM Heazell notified Council of the receipt of a petition from the residents of Great Shelford regarding local bus services. The petition would be considered as part of the review of bus services in the district being undertaken by the Scrutiny and Overview Committee.

#### **41. TO CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS:**

##### **41 (a) Northstowe: Setting an Expectation for Carbon Reduction and the Generation of Renewable Energy (Climate Change Working Group, 13 September 2007)**

Councillor Dr SA Harangozo moved the recommendations of the Climate Change Working Group, with an amendment to refer to a *robust* not *binding* programme in recommendation (6).

Council **RESOLVED** that the following criteria be agreed as a marker of expectation in consideration of the forthcoming Energy Strategy and subsequent outline planning application for Northstowe:

- (1) Code for Sustainable Homes Level 4 should be seen as a baseline from the outset (44% carbon reduction over 2006 Building Regulations);
- (2) A similar level of carbon reduction (44%) should be applied to commercial premises, with zero carbon being the immediate aspiration for all public buildings (as a way of demonstrating leadership);
- (3) A minimum of 20% renewable energy production on-site.
- (4) Inclusion of a concerted effort to bring forward the delivery of a five megawatt (electric) biomass combined heat and power (CHP) option (incorporating district heating) with full consideration being given to how such a facility could secure a strong revenue stream for the proposed Trust for the new settlement.
- (5) Exploration of the inclusion of a small cluster of wind turbines directly associated with the development of Northstowe and in which the community would have a defined stake - probably through the proposed Trust for the new settlement;
- (6) A robust programme to achieve zero carbon for all new build onsite by 2016;
- (7) All show-homes should incorporate full carbon and energy reduction measures and renewable energy technologies to promote carbon neutral living. All such options not included as standard should be available to purchase (or under a 'lend-lease' type arrangement) off-plan at a significant discount over the cost of retro-fitting; and
- (8) Active, transparent and genuine partnership working should be embraced, with full information and option sharing, in order to pursue all potentially achievable opportunities for minimising Northstowe's carbon footprint.

**41 (b) Parish Boundary Reviews: Cambridge Northern and Southern Fringes (Electoral Arrangements Committee, 5 October 2007)**

Council considered the recommendation of the Electoral Arrangements Committee in respect of parish boundary reviews. It was requested that details of changes to legislation governing boundary reviews be reported to the Committee as soon as they became known and that Local Ward Members be kept fully informed throughout any discussions leading to a boundary review process.

Councillor Mrs DSK Spink MBE proposed and Councillor NJ Scarr seconded the recommendation of the Committee, with an amendment adding a requirement that any discussions should have due regard to the needs of parishes which were likely to be affected.

Council **RESOLVED** that the Chief Executive be authorised to enter discussions with the Cambridge City Council regarding the carrying out of a full district / city boundary review, such discussions to have due regard to the needs of parishes likely to be affected.

**41 (c) Review of Polling Districts and Polling Places (Electoral Arrangements Committee, 5 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED** that the following changes to polling stations be approved:

Ward	Polling District	Letters	Proposal	Reason for Change
Balsham	Carlton	ZC1	Change of Polling Station from St Peters Church, Carlton to Caravan at Pinehawk Kennels, Church Road,	The Church is not considered suitable for use as a Polling Station.

			Carlton	
Fulbourn	Fulbourn Village	RB1	To review the need for a change in Polling Station location in January/February 2008.	It may be necessary to identify a temporary location for a Polling Station, having regard to the likely inclusion of the Community Centre at Haggis Gap in the Windmill Estate project.
Papworth and Elsworth	Conington	NE1	Change of Polling Station from Caravan, The White Swan, Conington to The Leas, Elsworth Road, Conington	To reflect the wishes of the electorate in Conington
Willingham and Over	Willingham	SD1	Change of Polling Station from Salvation Army Hall, Willingham to Ploughman Hall in Willingham	Stopped using the Ploughman Hall due to significant rise in hire charges. Have been able to renegotiated price and therefore Ploughman Hall is more accessible with improved parking provision.

#### 41 (d) Corporate Objectives, Council Values and Service Plans (Cabinet, 8 October 2007)

Council **RESOLVED** to affirm the top five values emerging from the Council voting exercise, as follows:

- Professionalism;
- Customer Service;
- Commitment to improving services;
- Mutual respect;
- Trust.

The voting on this item was recorded as follows:

**FOR: (27)**

Dr DR Bard  
EW Bullman  
TD Bygott

RE Barrett  
FWM Burkitt  
Mrs PS Corney

D Bird  
BR Burling  
Miss JA Dipple

SM Edwards  
R Hall  
Mrs CA Hunt  
RM Matthews  
CR Nightingale  
RJ Turner

Mrs SM Ellington  
JA Hockney  
PT Johnson  
DH Morgan  
Mrs DSK Spink MBE  
Mrs BE Waters

Mrs VG Ford  
MP Howell  
RMA Manning  
Mrs LA Morgan  
JH Stewart  
NIC Wright

**AGAINST:** (0)

**ABSTAINED:** (18)

JD Batchelor  
NN Cathcart  
Mrs SA Hatton  
Dr JE Lockwood  
A Riley  
RT Summerfield

Mrs PM Bear  
NS Davies  
Mrs EM Heazell  
RB Martlew  
Mrs DP Roberts  
Dr SEK van de Ven

AN Berent  
Dr SA Harangozo  
SGM Kindersley  
MJ Mason  
Mrs HM Smith  
JF Williams

**DID NOT VOTE:** (2)

Mrs VM Trueman

TJ Wotherspoon

**41 (e) Joint Planning Arrangements - Plan Making Arrangements (Cabinet, 8 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED** that the draft terms of reference for a joint plan making committee for specified growth sites (as attached as Appendix A to the report to Cabinet), amended following further member discussion detailed in paragraphs 10-13 of the report, be approved as the basis of negotiation with the Department of Communities and Local Government.

**41 (f) Review of Medium Term Financial Strategy (Cabinet, 8 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED** that, in order to meet projected needs of the growth areas and respond effectively to the needs identified in the development of the Sustainable Community Strategy and the Corporate Objectives, the Council approve the preparation of the Medium Term Financial Strategy on the basis set out in Appendix 1 and Appendix 2 to the report to Cabinet, noting the many uncertainties involved which will be addressed in the following months.

Voting on this Resolution was recorded as follows:

**FOR:** (30)

Dr DR Bard  
EW Bullman  
TD Bygott  
SM Edwards  
R Hall  
Mrs CA Hunt  
RM Matthews  
CR Nightingale  
Mrs DSK Spink MBE  
Mrs BE Waters

RE Barrett  
FWM Burkitt  
NS Davies  
Mrs SM Ellington  
JA Hockney  
PT Johnson  
DC McCraith  
AG Orgee  
JH Stewart  
TJ Wotherspoon

D Bird  
BR Burling  
Miss JA Dipple  
VG Ford  
MP Howell  
RMA Manning  
Mrs LA Morgan  
NJ Scarr  
RJ Turner  
NIC Wright

**AGAINST:** (12)

JD Batchelor  
Dr SA Harangozo

Mrs PM Bear  
Mrs SA Hatton

AN Berent  
Mrs EM Heazell

SGM Kindersley  
RT Summerfield

RB Martlew  
Dr SEK van de Ven

Mrs HM Smith  
JF Williams

**ABSTAINED: (5)**

NN Cathcart  
A Riley

Dr JE Lockwood  
Mrs DP Roberts

MJ Mason

**41 (g) Job Description for the Chairman of the Corporate Governance Committee (Constitution Review Working Party, 9 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED** that the role description for the Chairman of the Corporate Governance Committee, attached to the Agenda for the Constitution Review Working Party, be approved for incorporation into the Constitution.

**41 (h) Procedure for the Election of Chairman (Constitution Review Working Party, 9 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED**:

(1) That Council Standing Order 7 be amended

(i) By the addition of the following words:

“The Chairman of the Council shall be elected from among the councillors as the first business transacted at the Annual Council Meeting. Where the Chairman of Council is retiring, he/she should preside over the election of his/her successor. Where it is expected that he/she is to continue for a second year, the Chief Executive should preside, and the Chairman should leave the room for the duration of the election.

In all cases, nominees for the Chairmanship shall leave the room prior to voting on the Chairmanship”.

(ii) By the rewording of the following sentence:

“The Chief Executive or an officer nominated by him or her may preside at the election of the Chairman **but shall not be entitled to vote. In the event of a tie, the provisions of Standing Order 16.7 below shall be followed.**”

(2) That Council Standing Order 16.7 be amended to read as follows:

“Where there are three or more candidates for appointment and there is, after balloting, no candidate with a clear majority, meaning in this case the votes of more than 50% of members present and voting, the candidate with the least number of votes shall withdraw and there shall be a fresh ballot of the remaining candidates; and so on as necessary until a candidate has that majority. **Where there are two candidates only, or two candidates remain a vote shall be taken. In the event of a tie, a second vote shall be taken. In the event of a continuing tie, the matter shall be decided by the toss of a coin.**”

**41 (i) Employment Committee - Composition of Appointment Panels (Constitution Review Working Party, 9 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED** that the following changes to the Terms of Reference of the Employment Committee be agreed:

**(1) Appointment of Corporate Managers**

Ad hoc panel of **three** councillors to include the Staffing and Communications Portfolio Holder **or a** relevant Portfolio Holder.

**(2) Recommend to Council appointment of Chief Executive / Head of Paid Service and Executive Director / Monitoring Officer**

Ad hoc Panel of five councillors, comprising three Members of the Employment Committee and two Members of the Executive.

**(3)** That the Constitution Review Working Party be requested to consider whether these panels should be required to be politically proportionate.

**41 (j) Review of Cabinet Scheme of Delegation (Cabinet, 8 October 2007, Constitution Review Working Party, 9 October 2007)**

Council **RESOLVED**

- (1) That a revised Table 2B of the Constitution, incorporating changes to its scheme of delegation agreed by the Cabinet and attached to the report to the working party, be received.
- (2) That the Chief Executive be authorised to make the consequential changes to the Constitution necessary for consistency following Cabinet agreement of amendments to Table 2B.
- (3) That the changes to the Access to Information and Executive Procedure Rules set out in paragraph 10 of the report be approved, to allow for Portfolio Holder meetings to be held in public and at least on a quarterly basis.
- (4) That the following policies and plans are no longer matters requiring Council approval:
  - Capital Strategy and Asset Management Plan;
  - ICT Strategy;
  - Investment Strategy;
  - Workforce Plan.
- (5) That delegated authority be given to the Cabinet to approve, after opportunities for virement have been exhausted, in-year supplementary revenue and capital estimates up to level 3 (£50,000), subject to this expenditure being within approved policy, and that the relevant sections of the Constitution be amended as necessary.

**42. MOVE TO FOUR-YEARLY DISTRICT COUNCIL ELECTIONS**

Council **RESOLVED** that, a decision on the future of its electoral arrangements be further **DEFERRED** in light of legislative changes proposed within the Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Bill, and that the matter be brought before Council for further consideration in due course.

**43. REQUEST FOR SUPPORT FOR ROYAL ANGLIAN REGIMENT**

Council considered a report regarding a request for support to establish a 1<sup>st</sup> Royal Anglian Regiment Memorial Fund. Councillor VG Ford moved and Councillor RMA Manning seconded the recommendation set out in the report, considering the establishment of a fund to be an important and worthwhile cause which was deserving of the Council's support.



Some Members felt that, whilst the Armed Forces were deserving of the Council's full support, it was not appropriate to provide financial support to an organisation primarily based outside the district. Making an award would set a precedent for similar future requests where the Council had no agreed policy on charitable donations. Moreover, it would be more appropriate to seek individual donations for organisations such as the Royal British Legion which had for a long period worked to support the families of service personnel.

The Chairman requested that the Community Services Portfolio Holder investigate the development of a policy for charitable donations.

Council **RESOLVED** to support, in principle, the establishment of a 1st Royal Anglian Memorial Fund, and to make a sum of up to £5,000 available as a donation to the costs of the project, the precise amount to be determined by the Leader of the Council and Resources Portfolio Holder, following future discussions with neighbouring authorities and the Regiment.

#### **44. APPOINTMENTS TO OUTSIDE ORGANISATIONS**

Council **RESOLVED** to appoint Councillor Mrs JM Guest as a Trustee of the Francis John Clear Almshouses, Melbourn until May 2008, subject to her agreement.

Council **RESOLVED** to appoint Councillors SM Edwards (Conservative) and JD Batchelor (Liberal Democrat) as substitute members to the Joint Strategic Growth Implementation Committee.

#### **45. APPOINTMENT OF INDEPENDENT MEMBERS TO THE STANDARDS COMMITTEE 2007-08 TO 2011-12**

Council **NOTED** the appointment of Mrs KM English and Mr JG Williams to the Standards Committee as independent members serving four-year terms.

#### **46. APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE SCRUTINY AND OVERVIEW COMMITTEE**

The Chairman agreed to consider this item in order to expedite the Council's business, noting that it had not previously been identified on the Agenda for the meeting.

Council **RECEIVED** the nomination of the Conservative Group to appoint Councillor Mrs LA Morgan to the Scrutiny and Overview Committee in place of Councillor R Hall.

#### **47. UPDATES FROM MEMBERS APPOINTED TO OUTSIDE BODIES**

There were no updates from Members appointed to outside bodies.

#### **48. NOTICES OF MOTION**

##### **48 (a) Standing in the name of Councillors VG Ford and RJ Turner**

Councillor VG Ford moved and Councillor RJ Turner seconded the Motion set out at Agenda Item 13(a).

Council **RESOLVED:**

That South Cambridgeshire District Council (SCDC) gives its full support to Chief Constable Julie Spence OBE in the campaign for additional police funding to develop the necessary infrastructure to support policing in Cambridgeshire. SCDC will continue to work with the police as a partner.

The Chairman of Council is requested to write to both Mrs Spence and the Home Secretary Jacqui Smith.

**48 (b) Standing in the name of Councillor A Riley**

Councillor A Riley moved and Councillor NJ Scarr seconded a Motion in the following terms:

“The Leader of this Council, Cllr Ray Manning, was recently found guilty by the Standards Board of England of “failure to show respect” to a councillor by spreading false and profoundly damaging statements about that councillor. Given that “Mutual Respect” has recently been selected by this Council as one of its key Values, it is unacceptable for the Leader’s behaviour to breach this Value so flagrantly. Furthermore, at the Council’s February meeting Cllr Manning declared that this other councillor should actually resign from the Council after being found guilty by the SBE of “failure to show respect”. We are not suggesting that Cllr Manning should resign from the Council, but he demonstrates breathtaking hypocrisy telling one councillor to resign from the council but himself not even resigning as Leader. By his actions Cllr Manning has brought this Council and his office into disrepute.

Council mandates the Chairman to write to the Leader asking him to consider his position.”

Councillor RMA Manning, Leader of the Council, advised that he did not intend to consider his position. He hoped that Members would join him in focussing on improving the Council in the future rather than dwelling on past events which had been thoroughly investigated by the Standards Board for England.

Councillor SM Edwards moved and Councillor DC McCraith seconded a procedural motion under Standing Order 14.11 that Council proceed to the next business. The Motion, on being put, was declared carried. Council therefore **RESOLVED** to proceed to the next business.

**49. CHAIRMAN'S ENGAGEMENTS**

The Chairman’s engagements since the last meeting were noted.

The Vice-Chairman of the Council advised that he had attended the Chairman’s Reception at Fenland District Council on 20 July and a ceremony at which the first brick of the Cancer Unit at Great Shelford on 11 September 2007.

---

**The Meeting ended at 6.15 p.m.**

---